

PENNSYLVANIA ORNITHOLOGICAL RECORDS COMMITTEE
2469 Hammertown Road
Narvon, PA 17555

September 23, 1997

Jim Waldie
526 Smedley Avenue
Media, PA 19063

Dear Jim,

Thank you for submitting documentation on the dark phase Broad-winged Hawk you saw at Tyler Arboretum on 24 September to P.O.R.C. This record circulated the committee for two rounds and after careful review and much discussion, we regret that we are unable to accept this record. There was concern within the committee that the description submitted did not completely rule out the possibility that the bird was a dark phase or "Harlan's" Red-tailed Hawk. Some members felt the description of the subterminal tail band was not consistent with that of a dark phase Broad-winged Hawk. A dark phased Broad-winged Hawk should show two bands on the tail instead of just the presence of one as described.

This of course, does not mean the bird was not a dark-phased Broad-winged Hawk, merely, that the record is not beyond reasonable doubt for acceptance

We hope that this does not discourage you from submitting documentation on any rare birds you find in the future. Please be encouraged to send as much detail as possible when submitting a report.

Sincerely,

Nick Pulcinella
Chairman

Record # 184-01-1995

P.S. If it is any consolation, I voted for acceptance of this record both times.

184-01-1995

Report of Possible Dark-morph Broad-winged Hawk

Date: 24 September 1995

Time: 11:00 AM

Place: Tyler Arboretum Media PA

Weather: Mostly Cloudy Temp - approx 60°F

Winds 10-15 mph N-NW

While birding in the Middle Farm section of Tyler Arboretum I spotted a distant soaring buteo. My immediate impression of the bird was - Broad-winged Hawk!

As the bird soared closer I realized that it was dark on the underside.

The bird circled once nearly directly overhead so I was able to get a very good look at its plumage.

The entire underside of the body was dark. The underwing coverts were entirely dark. The underside of the flight feathers were light with dark tips - so that the trailing edge of the wing showed a dark outline. The underside of the tail was mostly light except for a prominent dark band

towards the end of the tail.

I could not tell whether this dark band was terminal or sub-terminal

The head of the bird was dark.

I did not notice any mottling or variations in shading on any of the dark areas.

The bird soared in a fairly straight line from the NE. I suspect that he may have seen something in the field nearby because he pulled up (?) and made one slow full circle before he continued on. During this circle I noticed him moving his head as if fixed on something. I was able to view the bird for approx 2 minutes. I observed the bird with Swift Audubon 10X50 binoculars.

One hour after observing the bird I consulted National Geographic Field Guide to the Birds of North America, Peterson Field Guide to Hawks (Clark + Wheeler) and Hawks in Flight (Danne, Sibley + Sutton) which helped me make the following determinations:

① The proportions of the bird did not appear right for Red-tailed Hawk. The wings were shorter and broader than I would expect for Red-tail. There was no hint of red color in the tail.

② The wings were definitely not long enough or pointed enough for Swainson's Hawk.

③ The bird did not seem large enough or long-winged enough for Rough-legged Hawk.

Another point that helped me rule out Swainson's + Rough-legged was the way the bird was soaring on flat wings.

④ The bird did not show the crescent underwing panels typical of Red-Shouldered Hawk.

I believe that this bird was a dark-morph Broad-winged Hawk, perhaps an immature bird.

Jim Waldie
526 Smedley Ave.
Media, PA 19063

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Voting Tabulation - Round # 2 of 2

Species: Broad-winged Hawk (*Buteo platypterus*)

Date of Sighting: 24 September 1995 to 24 September 1995

Location: TYLER ARBORETUM

County: DELAWARE

Observer(s): Jim Waldie

Date of Submission: 1995

Submitted by: Jim Waldie

Written Description: YES Photo: NO Specimen: NO

Recording: NONE

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV	Class V			Abstain
					A	B	C	
F. Haas			X					
N. Pulcinella			X					
E. Kwater				X				
R. Ickes				X				
G. McWilliams				X				
P. Schwalbe			X					
S. Feldstein						X		
TOTALS			3	3		1		
DECISION				X				

Comments:

Signature (Secretary):

J. C. Haas

Date:

2-22-97

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Voting Tabulation - Round # 1 of

Species: **Broad-winged Hawk (Buteo platypterus)**

Date of Sighting: **24 September 1995 to 24 September 1995**

Location: **TYLER ARBORETUM**

County: **DELAWARE**

Observer(s): **Jim Waldie**

Date of Submission: **1995**

Submitted by: **Jim Waldie**

Written Description: **YES** Photo: **NO** Specimen: **NO**

Recording: **NONE**

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV	Class V			Abstain
					A	B	C	
F. Haas			X					
N. Pulcinella			X					
E. Kwater				X				
R. Ickes				X				
G. McWilliams			X					
P. Schwalbe			X					
S. Feldstein						X		
TOTALS			4	2		1		
DECISION								

Comments:

Send for second round.

Signature (Secretary):

J. C. Hawk

Date:

5-1-96